A Meta-Synthesis Research of Articles on Turkish as a Foreign Language Teaching Sets

OPEN ACCESS

Volume: 11

Special Issue: 1

Month: December

Year: 2022

E-ISSN: 2582-1334

Received: 27.08.2022

Accepted: 25.11.2022

Published: 20.12.2022

Citation:
Özbal, B. (2022). A meta-synthesis research of articles on Turkish as a foreign language teaching sets. *Shanlax International Journal of Education, 11*(S1), 150-169.

DOI:
https://doi.org/10.34293/education.v11iS1-Dec.5560

Bayram Özbal
Ministry of National Education, Turkey
https://orcid.org/0000-0002-9054-8963

Abstract
This study aimed to analyze the articles examining five teaching sets commonly used in teaching Turkish as a foreign language from different perspectives by using meta-synthesis method and to reveal the research tendency in the field. For this purpose, 136 articles published in different journals in the ULAKBIM TR index, Dergi Park, ASOS, and Google Scholar databases were accessed by searching the identified keywords. The articles have been analyzed in terms of the publication year, subject area, index, method, name of the teaching set examined in the article, book type, level/grade, sample group, and data collection tool if exists. As a result of the analysis, three main themes were formed: articles analyzing teaching sets, articles taking opinions about teaching sets, and articles analyzing teaching sets and taking opinions about these sets. Under these themes, the subject areas of the articles, the teachings set, the levels, and the grades were analyzed in detail. It was realized that the number of articles that took opinions about the teaching sets and the number of articles that both analyzed and took opinions about the teaching sets was limited. According to the results of the research, it was detected that the document analysis method was mostly used in the articles, the textbooks included in the teaching sets were mostly included in the article samples, and the teaching sets were mostly analyzed in terms of culture transfer/cultural elements and vocabulary. It was also concluded that in articles examining a single teaching set, basic and intermediate level text and workbooks were included more in the article samples, but in articles examining more than one teaching set, there was a gradual decrease from basic level to advanced level.

Keywords: Teaching Turkish as a Foreign Language, Teaching Sets, Textbooks, Meta-Synthesis

Introduction

Divan-i Lugat-i Turk, written by Kashgarli Mahmud in the 11th century for teaching Turkish to Arabs, is accepted as the first work prepared for teaching Turkish to foreigners (Barin, 2010; Kalfa, 2019; Maden, 2021). From this work to the present day, many works have been published by both foreigners and Turks for teaching and learning Turkish as a foreign language (TFL) (Bicer, 2012; Ozbal, 2020; Sahin & Yesilyurt, 2017). In recent years, the acceleration of institutionalization efforts in the field of TFL teaching has increased the number of textbooks written for this purpose.

The Turkish Language Teaching Centre established by Ankara University in 1985 can be regarded as the first step towards institutionalization in this field. The increasing interest in TFL education in Turkey with the Great Student Project launched in 1992 has accelerated the institutionalization efforts in this field. It can be claimed that great progress has been achieved in institutionalization efforts with the establishment of many institutions and organizations such as the Turkish Maarif Foundation, Yunus Emre Institute, and Turkish language teaching centers opened in many universities in the period from this date to the present day (Kose & Ozsoy, 2020). With the completion of the institutionalization process, it can be stated that TFL teaching has experienced its golden age.

Many institutions and organizations have started preparing their textbooks for teaching TFL. Yedi Iklim Turkish teaching set prepared by Yunus Emre Institute, Turkish for Foreigners teaching set prepared by Van Yuzuncu Yil University, and Turkish for Foreigners teaching set prepared by Gazi University are just a few of them. It is seen that these books have been transformed into a set consisting of materials such as workbooks, teacher's guidebooks, CDs, DVDs, Teacher's packs, and enriched e-books by making use of the developments in the field of information and communication technologies. In recent years, there has been a great increase in the number of articles on teaching sets prepared for TFL teaching. It has therefore become necessary to systematically analyze the articles examining the teaching sets.

Many studies in the literature examine the trends of research in the field of TFL teaching (Baki, 2019; Bicer, 2017; Demir & Ozdemir, 2017; Ozer & Tuna, 2020). However, when the current situation is examined in terms of TFL teaching sets, it is evident that textbooks are analyzed from different perspectives in the majority of articles. A single teaching set was included in the sample in some of these articles. For instance, Kahtali and Aslan (2021) examined Istanbul Turkish for Foreigners B1 textbook in terms of listening strategies; Can (2021)examined the texts in Journey to Turkish A1-A2 textbooks in terms of readability; Ekinci (2020) examined Yeni Hitit Turkish for Foreigners basic level textbook in terms of writing activities. In some articles, more than one textbook was included in the sample. For instance, Ilgun and Nurlu (2021) examined speaking activities in B1 and B2 level textbooks belonging to two different teaching sets in terms of intercultural communicative approach; Gocen and Okur (2016) examined A1, A2, B1, B2, and C1 textbooks belonging to three different teaching sets in terms of frequency and prevalence of words; Omeroglu (2016)examined A1 level textbooks belonging to four different teaching sets in terms of form and content features.

Another focus of research on textbooks is the analysis of theses. Maden (2021)examined the postgraduate theses on TFL teaching sets in detail under the titles of the year of publication, type, university, subject area, methods, and language levels. The most comprehensive research on textbooks was conducted by Kemiksiz (2021). In his study, Kemiksiz examined the distribution of articles and theses on textbooks according to the years, type of thesis, universities, number of authors, title of consultant, number of authors, sample selection, level of textbooks, and subject selection in detail. In most of the postgraduate theses in the field of TFL teaching, it is concluded that textbooks are at the top of the research sample (Baki, 2019; Celebi et al., 2019; Turkben, 2018).

As mentioned above, in the past decade much research has focused on examining TFL teaching sets from different perspectives. Despite such a large number of articles on teaching sets but it remains unclear which teaching sets, levels, and grades were analyzed the most and in which subject areas the textbooks were analyzed. For this reason, the purpose of this study was to gather the articles about the teaching sets of TFL under a single roof and to deal with them holistically. It is thought that anin-depth analysis of the articles analyzing the teaching sets will enable researchers who want to conduct a research on this subject to use their time more effectively, to access and review the researches easily. In addition, it is thought that it will give researchers an idea about which teaching set is analyzed in terms of which subject area and it will guide future researches that will address teaching sets from different perspectives and avoid repeating the same studies in the future. To achieve these aims, the following questions were sought to be answered in the research:

- Which research methods were used in the articles analyzing TFL teaching sets?
- In which subject areas were the teaching sets analyzed?
- How were the TFL teaching sets analyzed in the articles?
- Which language level was most frequently analyzed in the articles?
- How were the articles analyzing TFL teaching sets handled concerning their purpose?
- How were the articles that took views on TFL teaching sets handled?

Methodology

In this section, information about the research model, data collection tool, and data analysis is presented.

Research Design

In this research, the meta-synthesis method, one of the qualitative research methods, was used. Meta-synthesis is defined as the systematic review, integration, and interpretation of the similarities and differences of the findings obtained from researches in a particular field(Calik & Sozbilir, 2014).Within the framework of the research, articles analyzing TFL teaching sets were examined in depth through the meta-synthesis method.

Data Collection

This research consists of analyzing the articles in which CLT teaching sets were analyzed until 2022. To ensure validity, and reliability in the meta-synthesis research, the data collection method, inclusion, and exclusion criteria of the studies should be explained in detail (Calik & Sozbilir, 2014; Polat & Ay, 2016). To ensure the validity and reliability of the study, all articles that met the criteria determined by the researcher were included in the study. The inclusion and exclusion criteria of the articles are as follows;

- Articles on five teaching sets, which are Yedi Iklim Turkish (Yedi Iklim), Istanbul Turkish for Foreigners (Istanbul), Yeni Hitit Turkish for Foreigners (Yeni Hitit), Turkish for Foreigners (Gazi), Izmir Turkish for Foreigners (Izmir), were included in the research.
- Articles comparing TLF teaching sets with textbooks prepared for teaching languages such as English, and German were excluded.
- Articles presented in scientific events such as symposiums and congresses and whose abstract or full text was published in the proceedings book were not included.
- Postgraduate studies on TFL teaching sets were not included in the sample of the research.

ULAKBIM TR index, Dergi Park, ASOS, and Google Scholar databases were used for the data collection process. The scanning process in databases was initiated on 15 February 2022 and ended on 15 April 2022. In these databases; “Turkish for foreigners”, “Turkish as a foreign language”, “teaching sets”, and “textbooks” key expressions were used for searching. The search was expanded by adding the names of the teaching sets analyzed within the scope of the research next to these key expressions. The determined articles were recorded in the data collection form using codes A1, A2, A3, ... , and 135, A136, and all articles included in the analysis are listed in Appendix 1 by year.For the reliability of the coding, the coding process was repeated by the researcher one month later, and it was found that the two codings were 98% consistent with each other.The distribution of the articles included in the study by publication year is as follows.

Table 1 Distribution of Articles on TFL Textbooks Series by Year

Years	Article frequency
2012	3
2013	1
2014	2
2015	7
2016	6
2017	11
2018	17
2019	29
2020	35
2021	25
Total	136

As can be seen in Table 1, a total of 136 articles published between 2012-2021 are included in the research. The years with the highest number of articles are 2020, 2019, and 2021 respectively (f=35, f=29, f=25). It can be stated that there has been a gradual increase in the number of articles since 2013. This finding indicates that in recent years, there has been a significant increase in the number of articles on TFL teaching sets.

Data Collection Tool

The articles that met the criteria given above were recorded in the data collection form. The data collection form consists of the title of the article, year of publication, subject, index, method, name of the

teaching set analyzed in the article, book type, level/grade, if any, sample group, and data collection tool. The data collection form was evaluated by two field experts to ensure its validity. The Kappa test was applied to analyze the opinions of the field experts regarding the data collection form. Kilic (2015) defines this test as a statistical reliability test for the agreement between two or more observers, and interprets the Kappa value in this test as "+1"which means that the results of the observers are completely compatible with each other, "0" means that the agreement of the observers depends on chance, and "-1" means that the evaluations of the observers are opposite to each other. The Kappa value of the data collection form employed in the study was calculated as 0.71. This value can be interpreted as a high level of agreement between the opinions of the field experts.

Data Analysis

In the research, descriptive statistics, and meta-synthesis (thematic content analysis) were used to evaluate the data. Frequency and percentage analyses of the articles included in the research were performed for the year of publication, models, and index information. The subject area, book type, level/grade, sample group, and data collection tools of the teaching set examined in the article were analyzed by the meta-synthesis method. As a result of this analysis, three main themes were formed: articles analyzing teaching sets, articles taking opinions about teaching sets, and articles analyzing teaching sets and taking opinions. Under each theme, detailed information was given about the sample of the articles (names, levels, and grades of teaching sets), subject areas, sample group, and data collection tools if exists.

Findings

In the findings section of the research, the analyses of the articles examining TFL teaching sets in terms of different variables, and the findings obtained are presented. In this context, firstly, the distribution of the articles included in the research according to the indexes in the journal classification determined by the Presidency of the Inter university Council of Turkey according to the criteria for being an associate professorship in the field of educational sciences is shown in Table 2.

Table 2 Distribution of Articles by Indexes

Index	Frequency	Percent
International	7	5.14
ULAKBİM TR	57	41.91
National	67	49.26
Both national and ULAKBİM TR	5	3.67
Total	136	100

As seen in Table 2, 7 of the articles on TFL teaching sets were published in journals indexed in international indexes. The majority of the articles were published in journals indexed in ULAKBIM (f=57) and national indexes (f=67). The number of articles published in both international and ULAKBIM indexed journals (f=5) is quite limited. The fact that most of the articles were published in journals indexed in ULAKBIM and national indexes can be explained by the fact that most of the journals published in international indexes do not publish articles analyzing textbooks. In the article analyzing TFL teaching sets, 13 different research models were used. The distribution of these models used in the articles is presented in Table 3.

Table 3 Research Models of Articles

Research Models	Frequency
Document analysis	70
Survey	13
Not mentioned	12
Qualitative research	11
Case study	9
Descriptive	7
Basic qualitative research	3
Theoretical analytical research	2
Content analysis	2
Mixed research	2
Corpus-based approach	1
Action research	1
Text content analysis	1
Total	136

According to Table 3, it is found that the document analysis method (f=70) is mostly used in the articles on TFL teaching sets. This method is followed by the survey method (f=13). In some articles, the research method was not mentioned (f=12) or detailed information about the research method was not provided (f=11). The case (f=12), and descriptive (f=7) models are among the frequently employed models in analyzing teaching sets.

Three main themes were determined for the articles analyzing TFL teaching sets. These themes consist of articles analyzing TFL teaching sets, articles taking opinions about TFL teaching sets, and articles analyzing TFL teaching sets and taking opinions. The number of articles according to the three main themes is presented in Table 4.

Table 4 Themes

Themes	Frequency	Percent
Analyzing TFL teaching sets	126	92.64
Articles taking opinions about TFL teaching sets	5	3.67
Articles analyzing TFL teaching sets and taking opinions	5	3.67
Total	136	100,00

As seen in Table 4, the majority of the articles analyzing TFL teaching sets (f=126) consist of articles analyzing teaching sets. It is also seen that the number of articles that take opinions about the teaching sets (f=5) and the number of articles that analyze the teaching sets and take opinions (f=5) is quite limited. In this part of the study, meta-syntheses of the detected articles under these three main headings are presented. Under each heading; the subject area, book type, level/grade, if any, sample group, and data collection tools of the articles were analyzed in detail by the meta-synthesis method.

Meta-Synthesis of Articles Analyzing Teaching Sets

In the articles analyzing the TFL teaching sets (f=126), 14 subject areas were determined. The findings related to the distribution of the articles analyzing the TFL teaching sets according to the subject areas are presented in Table 5.

Table 5 Subject Areas of Articles Analyzing Teaching Sets

Subject areas	Articles	Frequency
Vocabulary	A6, A15, A27, A32, A44, A52, A55, A59, A65, A66, A67, A68, A71, A81, A86, A88, A91, A94, A101, A104, A107, A117, A119, A125, A127	25
Cultural transfer/ cultural elements	A1, A2, A4, A7, A11, A20, A28, A31, A34, A36, A38, A41, A45, A48, A77, A78, A92, A106, A108, A110, A120, A124, A127	23
Reading (texts, readability, types)	A8, A16, A21, A24, A25, A26, A30, A49, A53, A64, A71, A82, A85, A102, A116, A136	16
Listening (texts, activities, strategies)	A23, A29, A50, A51, A54, A56, A65, A72, A79, A84, A95, A112, A114, A120, A132	15
Grammar	A22, A40, A61, A69, A70, A80, A89, A97, A98, A99, A100, A103, A118, A121, A126	15
Writing (activities)	A5, A10, A13, A18, A33, A37, A96, A113, A122, A128	10
Teaching principles, methods, and approaches	A17, A52, A63, A73, A105, A131, A135	7
Vocabulary teaching	A14, A42, A83, A109	4
Speaking (activities)	A9, A57, A120	3
Values education	A58, A123	2

Text-image harmony/ progressivity	A35, A129	2
Well-known people	A62, A93	2
Gender preference	A74, A130	2
Other (pronunciation, exercise instructions, unit evaluation, text adaption, Turk-Turkey image)	(A39, A60, A87, A90, A115)	5

Note: As some articles covered two subject areas, frequencies were counted more than once.

The findings in Table 5 reveal that TFL teaching sets were mostly analyzed in terms of vocabulary (f=25) and cultural transfer/cultural elements (f=23). These two subject areas were followed by reading, listening (f=15), and grammar (f=15). It is also revealed that the teaching sets were analyzed in terms of teaching principles, methods, and approaches (f=7) and vocabulary teaching (f=4). Teaching sets were analyzed in one or two articles in terms of values education, text-visual harmony/progressivity, well-known people, gender preference, pronunciation, exercise instructions, unit evaluation, text adaptation, and Turk-Turkey image.

The distribution of the articles examining a single teaching set according to the subject areas, and the teaching sets is as follows. Yedi Iklim teaching set was analyzed under the subject areas of cultural transfer/cultural elements(A36, A41, A106, A110, A124, A127), vocabulary (A44, A55, A59, A66,A68, A91, A101), reading (A8, A53, A136), teaching principles, methods and approaches (A17, A22, A63, A135), listening (A54, A79), writing (A33, A113), text-image harmony/progressivity (A35), values education(A58, A123), vocabulary teaching (A109), grammar (A126), and gender preference(A130). Istanbul teaching set was analyzed under the subject areas of cultural transfer/cultural elements(A4, A13, A20, A77, A92), reading (A25, A30, A71, A116), vocabulary (A67, A107, A125), writing (A10, A128), listening(A29, A132), speaking (A9), unit evaluation (A87), teaching approach (A105), and grammar (A122).Gazi teaching set was analyzed in the subject areas of cultural transfer/cultural elements(A7, A28, A45, A48, A108), listening (A23, A84, A114), reading (A16, A64), and vocabulary (A114). Yeni Hitit teaching set was analyzed in the subject areas of cultural transfer/cultural elements (A1, A2, A11), writing (A5, A96), vocabulary (A6, A117), grammar (A89), and text adaption(A90). Izmir teaching set was analyzed in the subject area of teaching approach (A73).

Teaching sets were compared in the subject areas of grammar (A40, A61, A69, A70, A80, A88, A97, A98, A99, A100, A103, A100, A118, A121), vocabulary (A15, A27, A32, A52, A65, A81, A86, A94, A104), reading (A21, A24, A26, A49, A82, A85, A95, A102), cultural transfer/cultural elements (A12, A31, A34, A38, A78) and writing (A18, A37, A122). Teaching sets were also compared in the subject areas of listening (A50, A56, A72),speaking (A51, A57, A120), well-known people (A62, A93), vocabulary teaching (A14, A42), text-image harmony (A129), teaching principles(A131), Turk-Turkey image (A115), vocabulary teaching (A83), gender preference (A74), exercise instructions (A60), and pronunciation (A39).

In the research, 71 articles analyzing a single teaching set were identified. In these articles, Yedi Iklim (f=30), Istanbul (f=20), Gazi (f=11), Yeni Hitit (f=9) and Izmir (f=1) teaching sets were analyzed. The samples of the articles mostly comprise text and workbooks. The sample of two articles consisted only of videos prepared for the teaching set. Video activities prepared for Yedi Iklim A1 textbooks (A136) and Istanbul teaching set(A112) were analyzed in two articles. The meta-analysis of other articles according to the teaching sets and levels/ grades is shown in Table 4.

As can be seen from the table above, the sample of most of the articles on TFL teaching sets consists of textbooks. The number of articles (A33, A59, A63, A73, A77, A105, A107, A116, A117) in which workbooks are included in the article sample is quite limited. The teacher's guidebook was included in the sample in only one article (A63). In the articles analyzing a single teaching set, Yedi Iklim (f=29) teaching set was analyzed the most. Yedi Iklim set

is followed by Istanbul (f=19), Gazi (f=11), and Yeni Hitit (f=9) teaching sets. Izmir teaching set constitutes the sample in only one article. Considering the analysis of teaching sets according to levels and grades, it is found that Yedi Iklim basic-level (A1-A2) text and workbooks were analyzed 42 times, intermediate level (B1-B2) text- and workbooks (40) and advanced level (C1-C2) text and workbooks were analyzed 25 times. Istanbul teaching set basic level books were analyzed 20 times, intermediate level books 30 times, and advanced level books 24 times. Gazi teaching set basic level books were analyzed 13 times, intermediate level books 12 times, and advanced level books 5 times. Yeni Hitit teaching set basic level books were analyzed12, intermediate level books 8, and advanced level books 4 times.

Table 6 Meta-Synthesis of Articles Examining a Single Teaching Set

Level	Basic				Intermediate				Advanced			
Grade	A1		A2		B1		B2		C1		C2	
Textbook/ Workbook	TB	WB	TB	WB	TB	WB	TB	WB	TB	WB	TB	WB
Yedi İklim (29)	A17, A22, A33, A41, A44, A53, A54, A55, A59, A63, A66, A68, A101, A106, A109, A110, A123, A124, A126	A33, A59, A63	A17, A22, A33, A41, A44, A53, A55, A59, A63, A66, A68, A101, A106, A109, A110, A123, A126	A33, A59, A63	A8, A22, A33, A35, A36, A41, A53, A55, A63, A66, A68, A79, A91, A106, A109, A113, A123, A126, A130	A33, A63	A8, A22, A33, A36, A41, A53, A55, A63, A66, A68, A106, A109, A123, A126, A130, A136	A33, A63	A8, A22, A33, A41, A53, A58, A63, A66, A68, A106, A109, A126, A127	A33, A63	A22, A33, A41, A53, A63, A66, A106, A109	A33, A63
Subtotal	**19**	**3**	**17**	**3**	**19**	**2**	**17**	**2**	**13**	**2**	**8**	**2**
İstanbul (19)	A4, A9, A10, A20, A30, A67, A77, A92, A125, A128	A77	A4, A9, A10, A20, A77, A92, A125, A128	A77	A4, A9, A10, A20, A29, A71, A77, A92, A105, A107, A125, A128, A132	A77, A105 A107	A4, A9, A10, A20, A29, A71, A77, A87, A92, A105, A125, A128	A77, A105	A9, A10, A13, A20, A25, A71, A77, A92, A116, A125	A77, A116	A9, A10, A13, A20, A25, A71, A77, A92, A116, A125	A77, A116
Subtotal	**10**	**1**	**8**	**1**	**13**	**3**	**12**	**2**	**10**	**2**	**10**	**2**
Gazi (11)	A16, A23, A45, A48, A108, A119		A16, A23, A45, A48, A108, A114, A119		A7, A16, A23, A28, A48, A108		A7, A16, A23, A48, A84, A108		A16, A23, A48, A64, A108			
Subtotal	**6**	-	**7**	-	**6**		**6**		**5**			
Yeni Hitit (9)	A1, A2, A6, A11, A96, A117	A117	A1, A2, A6, A11, A96		A1, A2, A5, A6, A90		A1, A2, A6		A1, A2, A6, A89			
Subtotal	**6**	**1**	**5**	-	**5**	-	**3**	-	**4**			
İzmir (1)	A73	A73										
Subtotal	**1**	**1**	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Total	**42**	**6**	**37**	**4**	**43**	**5**	**38**	**4**	**33**	**4**	**18**	**4**

A detailed look at the articles analyzing a single teaching set in Table 6 reveals three trends in sample selection. In the articles in the first group, all textbooks of a teaching set (A1, A2, A6, A9, A10, A16, A20, A22, A23, A33, A41, A48, A53, A63, A66, A77, A92, A106, A108, A109, A125, A126) were included in the sample of the article. In the articles in the second group, it is seen that the sample is preferred from basic level A1-A2 (A11, A17, A44, A45, A59, A67, A68, A96, A101, A110, A119), intermediate level B1-B2 (A7, A29, A36, A90, A91, A105, A130), or advanced level C1-C2 (A13, A25, A116) textbooks. In the articles in the third group, the sample teaching set consists of a single grade of textbooks such as A1 grade (A30, A54, A73, A117, A124, A135), A2 grade (A114), B1 grade (A5, A8, A28, A35, A79, A107, A112, A132), B2 grade (A84, A87, A136) and C1 grade books (A58, A64, A89, A127). However, there are also articles (A71, A123, A128) that do not comply with these three trends.

In the research, 55 articles analyzing more than one TFL teaching set were determined. The inclusion status of the teaching sets in the article sample is as follows: Yedi Iklim (f=42), Istanbul (f=44), Gazi (f=27), Yeni Hitit (f=33), and Izmir (f=5) sets were included in the article sample. The meta-synthesis of these articles is shown in Table 7.

It can be seen from the data in Table 7 that two (f=25), three (f=17), or four (f=13) teaching sets were compared in the articles. The number of articles (A14, A27, A52, A60, A86, A98, A115) in which the workbook was included in the article sample is limited. Teacher's guidebooks (A52, A86) and CDs with listening texts (A72, A86) were included in the sample in only two articles. Considering the examination status of the teaching sets according to levels and grades, it is seen that Yedi Iklim basic level (A1-A2) text and workbooks were examined 76 times, intermediate level (B1-B2) text and workbooks (49) and advanced level (C1-C2) text and workbooks 35 times. Istanbul teaching set basic level books were analyzed 75 times, intermediate level books 45 times, and advanced level books 31 times. Gazi teaching set basic level books were analyzed 38 times, intermediate level books 26 times, and advanced level books 14 times. Yeni Hitit teaching set basic level books were analyzed 56 times, intermediate level books 28 times, and advanced

level books 14 times. Izmir teaching set basic level books were analyzed 13 times, intermediate level books 6 times, and advanced level textbooks 3 times. In the articles in which more than one teaching set is included in the article sample, it is concluded that most of the basic level (A1-A2) text and workbooks of all teaching sets are analyzed.

Table 7 Meta-Synthesis of Articles Examining more than one Teaching Set

Level	Basic				Intermediate				Advanced			
Grade	A1		A2		B1		B2		C1		C2	
Textbook/ Workbook	TB	WB	TB	WB	TB	WB	TB	WB	TB	WB	TB	WB
Yedi İklim	A12, A26, A27, A34, A37, A39, A40, A50, A56, A57, A60, A61, A62, A65, A69, A70, A72, A74, A80, A81, A82, A83, A85, A86, A93, A94, A95, A99, A100, A103, A115, A118, A131	A27, A60, A86, A115	A12, A21, A26, A27, A31, A34, A37, A40, A50, A51, A56, A60, A62, A65, A69, A70, A72, A80, A81, A82, A83, A85, A86, A93, A94, A95, A98, A99, A100, A103, A115, A118, A131	A27, A60, A86, A98, A115	A34, A37, A52, A56, A57, A65, A69, A70, A72, A81, A82, A83, A85, A86, A93, A94, A95, A103, A115, A118, A120, A131	A52, A86, A115	A34, A37, A56, A65, A69, A70, A72, A81, A82, A83, A85, A86, A93, A94, A95, A103, A104, A115, A118, A120, A122, A131	A86, A115	A34, A37, A56, A57, A65, A69, A70, A72, A81, A82, A83, A85, A86, A93, A94, A95, A102, A103, A115, A118, A131	A86, A115	A81, A82, A83, A85, A86, A93, A94, A102, A115, A131	A86, A115
Subtotal	33	4	34	5	22	3	22	2	21	2	10	2
İstanbul	A12, A14, A15, A27, A32, A34, A37, A38, A39, A50, A56, A57, A60, A62, A65, A69, A70, A72, A74, A80, A82, A85, A86, A93, A95, A100, A103, A115, A118, A121, A129	A14, A27, A60, A86, A115	A12, A14, A15, A21, A27, A31, A32, A34, A37, A38, A50, A51, A56, A60, A62, A65, A69, A70, A72, A80, A82, A85, A86, A93, A95, A97, A98, A100, A103, A115, A118, A121, A129	A14, A27, A60, A86, A98, A115	A15, A18, A34, A37, A38, A42, A52, A56, A57, A65, A69, A70, A72, A82, A85, A86, A93, A95, A103, A115, A118	A52, A86, A115	A15, A34, A37, A38, A49, A56, A65, A69, A70, A72, A82, A85, A86, A88, A93, A95, A103, A115, A118, A122	A115	A24, A34, A37, A38, A49, A56, A57, A65, A69, A70, A72, A78, A82, A85, A86, A93, A95, A103, A115, A118	A86, A115	A24, A82, A85, A86, A93, A115	A86, A115
Subtotal	31	5	33	6	21	3	20	1	21	2	6	2
Gazi	A15, A34, A38, A39, A50, A60, A61, A62, A69, A74, A81, A83, A94, A95, A103, A118, A121, A129	A60	A15, A34, A38, A50, A51, A60, A61, A62, A69, A81, A83, A94, A95, A103, A118, A121, A129, A131	A60	A15, A34, A38, A42, A69, A81, A83, A94, A95, A103, A118, A131	-	A15, A34, A38, A49, A69, A81, A83, A94, A95, A103 A104, A118, A122, A131	-	A15, A34, A38, A49, A69, A78, A81, A83, A94, A95, A102, A103, A118, A131	-	-	-
Subtotal	18	1	18	1	12	-	14	-	14	-	-	-
Yeni Hitit	A12, A14, A15, A32, A34, A38, A39, A40, A50, A60, A62, A69, A70, A74, A81, A83, A94, A95, A99, A100, A103, A115, A118, A121, A129	A14, A60, A115	A12, A14, A21, A32, A34, A38, A40, A50, A51, A60, A62, A69, A70, A81, A83, A94, A95, A97, A99, A100, A103, A115, A118, A121, A129	A14, A60, A115	A15, A18, A34, A38, A42, A69, A70, A81, A83, A94, A95, A103, A115, A118,	A115	A15, A34, A38, A69, A70, A81, A83, A94, A95, A103, A115, A118,	A115	A15, A24, A34, A38, A69, A70, A81, A83, A94, A95, A103, A115, A118	A115		
Subtotal	25	3	25	3	14	1	12	1	13	1	-	-
İzmir	A26, A32, A38, A86	A86	A26, A32, A86, A97	A38, A86	A38, A86	A86	A38, A86, A88	A86	A38, A86	A86		
Subtotal	4	1	5	1	2	1	3	1	2	1		
Total	101	14	115	16	71	8	71	5	71	6	16	4

A detailed analysis of the articles analyzing more than one teaching set in Table 7 reveals that there are three different trends in sample selection. In the articles in the first group, it is seen that all textbooks belonging to the compared teaching sets were included in the article sample (A15, A34, A37, A38, A56, A57, A65, A69, A70, A72, A81, A82, A83, A85, A86, A93, A103, A115, A118). In the articles in the second group, basic level (A1-A2) textbooks (A14, A26, A27, A32, A40, A50, A60, A61, A62, A80, A99, 100, 121, 129, 131), intermediate level textbooks (A120) and advanced level textbooks (A102) were compared. In the third group, textbooks at the same grade belonging to different teaching sets such as A1 (A39, A74), A2 (A12, A21, A31, A51, A97, A98), B1 (A18, A42, A52) B2 (A88, A104, A123) and C1 (A78) were included in the article sample. Nevertheless, there are also articles (A24, A34, A55, A57) that do not comply with the three trends mentioned above.

Meta-Synthesis of Articles Taking Opinions about TFL Teaching Sets

The second main theme of the research consists of articles that take opinions about TFL teaching sets. Five articles were identified under this theme. In three of these articles, the sample consists of one teaching set, and in two of them more than one teaching set. In these articles, opinions were collected on the subject areas of general evaluation on Istanbul teaching set (A134), Istanbul basic level books listening texts (A133), and Yeni Hitit teaching set culture transfer (A3). Yedi Iklim, Istanbul, Gazi,and Yeni Hitit teaching sets (A75), Yedi Iklim, Istanbul and Gazi teaching sets (A47) were evaluated in general by taking opinions. The majority of the articles that take opinions about the teaching sets are about the general evaluation of the teaching sets (f=4). In these articles, unlike the studies analyzing the teaching sets, it was found that different data collection tools were used and the sample group to which these tools were applied differed. For this reason, the data collection tools used and the sample group to which the data collection tools were applied were analyzed in the articles on TFL teaching sets. It was detected that questionnaire (A3), interview form (A47, A134), and semi-structured interview (A75, A133) were used as data collection tools in the articles. In these articles, students (A47, A134), and teachers (A3, A47, A75, A133) were preferred as the sample group. In only one article (A47), the sample group consists of both students and teachers.

Meta-Synthesis of Articles Analyzing TFL Teaching Sets and Taking Opinions

The third main theme of the research consists of articles that analyze TFL textbook sets and take opinions about these sets. There are at least two data set sources in the articles analyzed under this theme. The first one is the data obtained from the teaching sets and the other one is the data obtained from the sample group about the teaching set in general or about a subject included in the teaching set. Five articles were identified under this theme. In three of these articles, the sample consists of a single teaching set. The effect of the themes in Yedi Iklim B1 and C1 textbooks on speaking skills (A76),Istanbul teaching set culture transfer (A111), and Istanbul B1 and C1 textbooks vocabulary (A46) were analyzed under the subject areas and opinions were taken on these subject areas.In the other two articles identified under this theme, Yedi Iklim, Istanbul, Gazi, Yeni Hitit, and Izmir teaching sets were compared and analyzed under the subject areas of grammar (A19), and Yedi Iklim, Gazi, and Yeni Hitit teaching sets were compared and analyzed under the subject areas of emphasis (A43) and opinions were taken on this subject area.In these articles, questionnaire (A19, A76), interview form (A43), semi-structured focus group interview (A111), and achievement test (A46) were employed as data collection tools. In these articles, students (A19, A46, A76, A111) and teachers (A19, A43, A111) were preferred as the sample group. In two articles (A19, A111), both students and teachers were preferred as the sample group.

Discussions, Conclusions, and Implications

In this research, in which the articles on five different teaching sets, which are most commonly used in teaching Turkish as a foreign language, were analysed by meta-synthesis method, the following results were obtained: It is concluded that the number of articles on TFL teaching sets has been increasing every year. The findings presented in many studies conducted in the field of TFL teaching that both the number of articles and the number of postgraduate theses have increased in recent years support the results of this research (Baki, 2019; Kemiksiz, 2021; Maden and Onal, 2021). This situation can be explained by the increase in the number of international students in Turkey, the increase in the interest in learning Turkish all over the world, the increase in the number of institutions and organizations providing Turkish education, and the increase in the number of teaching sets published. Regarding the methods of the articles examining TFL teaching sets, it is concluded that document review (f=70) and survey (f=13) are the two most commonly used methods. In some articles (f=11), it is seen that the method section is passed over as qualitative research and not clearly stated, and in some other articles (f=12), this section is not included in the method section at all. The use of document analysis, survey, case, and descriptive methods in the analyzed articles can be explained by the aim of examining and describing a situation existing in TFL teaching sets from different aspects. For this reason, it can be concluded that qualitative research methods are used in articles analyzing teaching sets, while quantitative and mixed studies are limited in number. In the studies examining the articles published in the field of TFL teaching, it was concluded that qualitative studies were used more (Bicer, 2017; Cevirme and Kocak, 2018; Maden and Onal, 2021). Taken together, these results suggest that it would be appropriate to conduct more quantitative and mixed articles in articles analyzing TFL teaching sets.

The majority of the articles analyzed consisted of articles analyzing teaching sets (f=126). It is seen that the number of articles that take opinions about the teaching sets (f=5), analyze the teaching sets, and take opinions about the sets (f=5) is limited. By increasing the number of articles that take opinions from teachers about the teaching sets, more comprehensive information on many issues such as the usefulness of the teaching sets, functionality, problems encountered during implementation, weaknesses, and strengths of the teaching sets can be revealed. Similarly, the opinions of the students about the teaching sets are important in terms of providing feedback about the teaching sets.

In terms of the subject areas analyzed in TFL teaching sets, it is concluded that they are mostly analyzed in terms of vocabulary (f=25) and cultural transfer/cultural elements (f=23). Similarly, Maden (2021), in his article in which he analyzed the

master's theses on textbooks, concluded that the most analyzed subject areas were vocabulary (f=24) and cultural transfer/cultural elements (f=20). Kemiksiz (2021)analyzed articles and postgraduate theses on SFL teaching textbooks and found that vocabulary/vocabulary teaching (f=55) and cultural elements/cultural transfer (f=51) took the first two places in subject preferences. It is seen that in the studies that take opinions about the teaching sets, it is mostly made in the form of a general evaluation of the subject area of the sets (f=3), but in the articles that analyzethe teaching sets and take opinions, it is seen that a specific subject area is focused on. In the articles examining a single teaching set, Yedi Iklim, Istanbul, Gazi,and Yeni Hitit teaching sets were mostly examined in the subject area of cultural transfer/cultural elements. However, it was found that this situation differed in the articles comparing the teaching sets. In the articles comparing the teaching sets, grammar (f=14), vocabulary (f=9), and analyzing reading texts (f=8) were the most common subject areas.

In the articles analyzing teaching sets, the majority of the sample group consists of only textbooks. The number of articles in which workbooks (f=16), teacher's guidebooks (f=3), videos (f=2), and CDs (f=2) are included in the sample group is limited. The fact that there is no article with only workbooks, or teacher's guidebooks as the sample in the articles analyzed can be considered as one of the striking results of this research. Teacher's guidebooks fulfill many functions such as teachers' preparation before the lesson, planning, using the textbook efficiently in classroom work, the order of the activities in the lesson, how to do them (Kilic, 2009), directing and shaping the activities or measuring student achievements (Gocer, 2008). For this reason, the adequacy of teacher's guidebooks should be examined in many aspects such as explaining the strategies, methods, and techniques recommended to teachers and including additional activities/ examples. In addition to their physical and visual features, workbooks should be evaluated in many aspects such as their compatibility with textbooks, their effectiveness in gaining skills, including the sufficient and varied number of exercises in terms of language skills, and determining their in-class and extra-curricular use. The fact that there is no article analyzing enriched e-book applications prepared for teaching sets can be seen as another striking result of the research. Further research could usefully explore the effectiveness of enriched e-book applications from different perspectives according to teacher and student experiences.

Regarding the presence of the teaching sets in the article sample, Yedi Iklim set was analyzed alone in 31 articles, while it was evaluated by comparing with other teaching sets in 47 articles. Istanbul teaching set was analyzed in 24 articles alone and in 47 articles it was analyzed by comparing with other teaching sets. Gazi teaching set was analyzed in 11 articles alone and in 31 articles by comparing with other teaching sets. Yeni Hitit teaching set was analyzed in 9 articles alone and in 36 articles by comparing with other teaching sets. Izmir teaching set was analyzed in one article alone, and in 6 articles it was analyzed by comparing with other teaching sets. Based on these data, it is concluded that Yedi Iklim, Istanbul, Gazi, Yeni Hitit, and Izmir teaching sets are analyzed the most in the articles respectively. This result of the research can be explained by the fact that Yedi Iklim, Istanbul, Gazi, and Yeni Hitit teaching sets are used more in teaching TFL(Erdil, 2018; Omeroglu, 2016).

Two different sample selection trends have emerged considering the analyses of teaching sets according to levels and grades. In the articles analyzing a single teaching set, sample selection differs depending on the teaching sets. The number of basic and intermediate level text and workbooks analyzed in Yedi Iklim, Gazi, and Yeni Hitit teaching sets was very close to each other, while in Istanbul teaching set, it was concluded that mostly intermediatelevel text and workbooks were analyzed. In the articles in which more than one teaching set was analyzed, it is evident that in five teaching sets, most of the basic level text and workbooks and then intermediate level text and workbooks were included in the article sample. It was determined that advanced level text and workbooks were analyzed the least in the teaching sets. This can be explained by the absence of C2 level text and workbooks in Yeni Hitit, Gazi, and Izmir teaching sets. Evaluating both sample selection trends together, it is concluded that the basic, intermediate, and advanced level books are

preferred respectively. This result of the study is in parallel with the finding of Kemiksiz (2021) in his article. In his article, Kemiksiz concluded that there was a gradual decrease in sample selection from the basic level to the advanced level.

It was determined that there were three different trends in the selection of the sample from the teaching sets. In the articles analyzing a single teaching set (f=71), three different approaches were identified in the sample selection. In the articles in the first group (f=22), books belonging to all levels of the teaching set, in the articles in the second group (f=21), basic, intermediate, or advanced level books, and in the articles in the third group (f=22), a single grade book belonging to any grade of the teaching set was selected. A similar sample selection tendency is observed in the studies comparing teaching sets. In the articles in the first group (f=19), all textbooks in the teaching sets were compared, while in the second group (f=17), basic, intermediate, or advanced-level books were compared. The studies in this group focused especially on basic level textbooks (f=15). In the third group of articles (f=15), a book belonging to any level of the teaching sets was compared. It is thought that it would be appropriate to examine all the books that make up the sets or the books at the same level together in the sample selection in the studies analyzing the teaching sets as it may provide set or level integrity.

References

Baki, Y. (2019). Research trends in teaching Turkish to foreigners'. *International Journal of Language Academy, 7*(3), 22–41.

Barin, E. (2010). Yabancılara Türkçe öğretimi amacıyla yazılan "Ecnebilere Mahsus" elifbâ kitabı üzerine. *Türklük Bilimi Araştırmaları, (27)*, 121-136.

Biçer, N. (2017). Yabancılara Türkçe öğretimi alanında yayınlanan makaleler üzerine bir analiz çalışması. Pamukkale *Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü Dergisi, (27)*, 236-247.

Biçer, N. (2012). Hunlardan günümüze yabancılara Türkçe öğretimi. *Uluslararası Türkçe Edebiyat Kültür Eğitim (TEKE) Dergisi, 1*(4), 107-133.

Calik, M., & Sözbilir, M. (2014). Parameters of content analysis. *Egitim ve Bilim-Education and Science, 39*(174).

Can, F. (2021). An examination of reading texts in a Journey to Turkish A1 and A2 level textbooks in terms of readability. *Shanlax International Journal of Education, 9*(2), 139–149.

Çelebi, C., et al. (2019). A meta-analysis study on graduate dissertations prepared Turkish teaching for foreigners in Turkey. *Journal of Primary Education, 1*(3), 39–52.

Cevirme, H., & Kocak, S. (2018). Trends in academic studies between 2015 and 2017 in teaching Turkish as a foreign language'. *Current Database in Education*, (in Ed. Senel, G.), IJOPEC Publication Limited.

Demir, K., & Özdemir, A. (2017). Yabancı dil olarak Türkçe öğretimi alanındaki bilimsel makalelere bakış. *Electronic Turkish Studies, 12*(14).

Ekinci, M. (2020). An investigation of writing activities in teaching Turkish for foreign learners: A coursebook analysis. *International Journal of Language Academy, 8*(5), 65-75.

Erdil, M. (2018). Türkiye Cumhuriyeti Yükseköğretim Kuruluna bağlı 209 üniversitede yabancılara Türkçe öğretimi. *Journal of International Social Research, 11*(60).

Göçer, A. (2010). İlköğretim Türkçe ders kitaplarının ölçme ve değerlendirme açısından incelenmesi. *Atatürk Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü Dergisi, 11*(1), 197-210.

İlgün, K. & Nurlu, M. (2021). Yabancı Dil Olarak Türkçenin Öğretiminde Kullanılan Konuşma Etkinliklerinin Kültürlerarası İletişimsel Yaklaşım Bağlamında Değerlendirilmesi. *Journal of Turkology, 31* (1) , 225-257.

Kahtali, B. D., & Aslan, M. (2021). New Istanbul B1 Level Turkish Course Book for International Students in Terms of Listening Strategies. *Education Quarterly Reviews, 4*.

Kalfa, M. (2019). Yabancılara Türkçe öğretiminde "-mA˚k" ve "-mA˚" mastar eklerinin öğretimi. *Ana Dili Eğitimi Dergisi, 7*(4), 1063-1076.

Kemiksiz, Ö. (2021). Yabancı dil olarak Türkçe öğretimi ders kitapları üzerine yapılan

araştırmaların eğilimleri. *Bayburt Eğitim Fakültesi Dergisi, 16*(Özel Sayı), 34-56.

Kilic, A. (2009). Requirement and content of teacher guide book in primary school-primary stage lessons. *The Journal of Institute Social Sciences, 21*(1), 295–330.

Köse, D.,&Özsoy, E. (2020). Türkiye'de yabancılara Türkçe öğretiminin otuz yılı: 1990-2020. *Turkophone, 7*(2), 27-54.

Maden, S. (2021). Analysis of Postgraduate Theses Related to Textbooks on Teaching Turkish as a Foreign Language'. *Social Sciences: Theory & Practice, 5*(1), 90–102.

Maden, S., & Onal, A. (2021). Research tendencies of postgraduate theses related to teaching Turkish as a foreign language. International *Journal of Education Science and Technology, 7*(1), 42–56.

Ömeroğlu, E. (2016). Review of the textbooks prepared for teaching Turkish to foreigners. *Unpublished Doctoral Thesis. Sakarya University Institute of Educational Sciences, Sakarya*.

Özbal, B. (2020). Osmanlıdan günümüze Almanlar için hazırlanmış yabancı dil olarak Türkçe kitapları: Bir kaynakça denemesi. *International Journal of Language Academy, 31*(31), 180-195.

Tuna, S. T., &Özer, H. (2020). Yabancılara Türkçe öğretimi konusunda yayımlanmış bilimsel çalışmalar üzerine bir inceleme. *Muğla Sıtkı Koçman Üniversitesi Eğitim Fakültesi Dergisi, 7*(2), 81-98.

Polat, S., & Osman, A. Y. (2016). Meta-sentez: Kavramsal bir çözümleme. *Eğitimde Nitel Araştırmalar Dergisi, 4*(2), 52-64.

Sahin, A., & Yesilyurt, E. (2017). bibliographic research of books which written to teach Turkish to the english during the Ottoman period. *Karaelmas Journal of Educational Sciences, 5*(1), 102-113.

Türkben, T. (2018). Evaluation of postgraduate studies conducted on teaching Turkish as a foreign language. *International Journal of Turkish Literature Culture and Education, 7*(4), 2464-2479.

Appendix 1 Articles Analysed in the Research

- **A1**. Yilmaz, Fatih. 'Cultural Transmission through Teaching Turkish as a Foreign Language Course Books'. *Turkish Studies, vol. 7*, no. 3b, 2012, pp. 2751-2759.
- **A2**. Tum, Gulden, and Ozlem Sarkmaz. 'The place of Cultural Items in the Books Teaching Turkish as a Foreign Language. *H. U. Journal of Education*, vol. 43, 2012, pp. 448-459.
- **A3**. Karababa, Z. Canan. and Selda U. Taskın (2012). 'An Evaluation of the Course Books for Teaching Turkish as a Foreign Language Based on Teacher Opinions'. *Language Journal, vol. 157*, no. 0, 2012, pp. 65-81.
- **A4**. Okur, Alpaslan and Funda Keskin. 'Transmission of Cultural Elements in Turkish Teaching to Foreigners'. *The Journal of Academic Social Science Studies, vol. 6*, no. 2, 2013, pp. 1619-1640.
- **A5**. Yılmaz, Fatih. 'A Research on the Writing Activities of Yeni Hitit Turkish for Foreigners Course Book 2'. *International Journal of Turkish Education Sciences*, no. 2, 2014, pp. 37-48.
- **A6**. Arslan, Nazmi, and Erhan Durukan. 'Examination of Vocabulary Elements in Textbooks for Teaching Turkish to Foreigners'. *International Journal of Language Academy, vol. 2*, no. 4, 2014, pp. 247-265.
- **A7**. Kutlu, Adem. 'The Use of Culture as a Tool to Teach Turkish forForeigners: The Example of Turkish Instruction Set for Foreigners (B1-B2 Level)'. *Kastamonu Education Journal, vol. 23*, no. 2, 2015, pp. 697-710.
- **A8**. Serin, Nilufer, and Emine D. Turan. 'Investigation According to the Text of the Type,Themes and Originality in Yunus Emre Turkish Teaching Books'. *International Journal of Turkish Literature Culture Education, vol. 4*, no. 3, 2015, pp. 1229-1250.
- **A9**. Yavuz, K. Muazzez. 'Interaction Level of Speaking Activities in a Coursebook Series of Teaching Turkish as a foreign Language'. **HAYEF Journal of Education, vol. 12**, no. 2, 2015, pp. 133-145.
- **A10**. Diliduzgun, Sukran. 'Writing Activities in Teaching Turkish as a Foreign Language in the Context of Action-Oriented Approach'. *Journal*

of Language Education and Research, vol. 1, no. 2, 2015, pp. 16-34.

- **A11**. Bayraktar, Semra. 'The Investigation of Cultural Transmission in Yeni Hitit 1 Turkish Course Book for Foreigners'. *H.Ü. Yabancı Dil Olarak Türkçe Araştırmaları Dergisi*, no. 2, 2015, pp. 7-23.
- **A12**. Durer, Z. Selin. 'A Content Analysis Related to the CulturalElements in Three Turkish as a Foreign Language Textbooks'. *H.Ü. Yabancı Dil Olarak Türkçe Araştırmaları Dergisi*, no. 2, 2015, pp. 51-63.
- **A13.** Erdem, D. Mehmet, Mesut Gun, and Betul Karateke. 'The Analysis of İstanbul Teaching Turkish to Foreigners Set Prepared for Advanced Level in Terms of Culture Transmission'. *International Journal of Language Academy, vol. 3*, no. 1, 2015, pp. 8-17.
- **A14**. Ugur, Fidan, and Nahide I. Azizoglu. 'Assessment of Textbooks for Teaching Turkish as a Foreign Language in terms of Vocabulary Teaching'. *Journal of Mother Tongue Education, vol. 4*, no. 1, 2016, pp. 151-166.
- **A15**. Gocen, Gokcen, and Alpaslan Okur. 'Frequency and Extensiveness of Words inTurkish Textbooks for Foreigners'. *Journal of National Education, vol. 45*, no. 210, 2016, pp. 447-476.
- **A16**. Zorbaz, K. Zeki, and Mustafa Koroglu. 'The Word-Sentence Lengths and Readability Levels of Texts in Gazi Tömer Turkish Textbooks for Foreigners'. *Turkish Studies, vol. 11*, no. 3, 2016, pp. 2509-2524.
- **A17**. Basar, Umut. 'Assessment of Yunus Emre Institute Turkish Education Set of "Yedi İklim" (Basic Level: A1, A2) Based on Constructivism Method'. *Aydın Tömer Dil Dergisi, vol. 1*, no. 2, 2016, pp. 55-77.
- **A18**. Tanriverdi, Ayse Esin and Gulden. 'Authenticity in Writing Activities in TFL Course Books: A Comparative Study On Writing Activities in Yeni Hitit and Istanbul Turkish Coursebooks for Foreigners'. *Turkophone, vol. 3*, no. 2, 2016, pp. 18-36.
- **A19**. Fidan, Dilek. 'Grammar Subjects in Turkish as a Foreign Language Course Books and Teachers'-Learners' Views. *Turkish Studies, vol. 11*, no. 14, 2016, pp. 257-276.
- **A20**. Dogru, Meral, and Haktan Kapla. 'The use of Turkish Folklore and Turkish Folk Literature Elements in Teaching Turkish to Foreigners: Istanbul Turkish Language Teaching Set Sample'. *The Pursuit of History-International Periodical for History and Social Research*, no.17, 2017, pp. 227-240.
- **A21**. Turgut, Elif, Neslihan Karakus, and Celile E. Okten. 'Assessment of A2 Level Reading Texts in Hitit, İstanbul and Yedi İklim Course Books according to The Cef-Estim Guide'. *Turkish Studies, vol. 12*, no. 33, 2018, pp. 475-490.
- **A22**. Tum, Gulden. 'A Methodological Aspect of Turkish Language Course Books for Foreigners: Deductive and Inductive Methods'. *Turkish Studies, vol. 12*, no. 33, 2017, pp. 491-500.
- **A23**. Tabak, Gurkan, and Ali Gocer. 'An Investigation of Listening Activities at A1-C1 Levels in Teaching Turkish as aForeign Language'. *Cumhuriyet International Journal of Education, vol. 6*, no. 3, 2017, pp. 400-411.
- **A24**. Bicer, Nursad, and Yakup Alan. 'Comparison of Readability Degree of Texts in Yeni Hitit 3and İstanbul C1+ Text Books Which Are Used in Teaching Turkish to Foreigners'. *Mersin University Journal of the Faculty of Education, vol. 13*, no. 3, 2017, pp. 1130-1139
- **A25**. Tiryaki, E. Nur, and Seyit O. Dogan. 'Examination of Reading Texts in Terms of Types of Information in Turkish as a Foreign Language Course Books (Example of İstanbul C1/+ Course Book)'. *Journal of Mother Tongue Education, vol. 5*, no. 3, 2017, pp. 503-518.
- **A26**. Cekici, Y. Emre, and Mehmet Kara. 'Intertextual Progressivity in Textbooks Used in Teaching Turkish as a Foreign Language: A Comparative Study on Yedi İklim Türkçe and İzmir'. *Bartın University Journal of Faculty of Education, vol. 6*, no. 2, 2017, pp. 411-426.
- **A27**. Kalenderoglu, Ihsan, and Hatice Arslan. 'Expressions of Emotion in Course Books Teaching Turkish as a Foreign Language'. *Education and Society in the 21th Century, vol. 6*, no. 17, 2017, pp. 503-519.
- **A28**. Sinecen, Fatma. 'Yabancılara Türkçe

Öğretimi Kitaplarında Kültürümüze Ait Unsurların Kullanımı: Gazi Üniversitesi TÖMER B1 Kitabı Örneği'. *AKRA Kültür Sanat ve Edebiyat Dergisi, vol. 5*, no. 13, 2017, pp. 133-150.

- **A29**. Tiryaki, E. Nur, and Nuray Kayaturk. 'Evaluation of Listening Texts in Coursebooks of Teaching Turkish as a Foreign Language in Terms of Implicit Meaning (Istanbul B1-B2 Level Course)'. *Mustafa Kemal University Journal of Graduate School of Social Sciences, vol. 14*, no. 39, 2017, pp. 300-319.
- **A30**. Gun, Mesut, and Buse S. Piskin. 'Evaluation of Level Istanbul for Foreigners Turkish Course Book A1 in Terms of Types of Dialogue Used in the Teaching for Turkish as a Foreign Language". *Researcher, vol. 5*, no. 4, 2017, pp. 477-488.
- **A31**. Cetinoglu, Gulnaz, and Meral Gullulu. 'Comparison of Istanbul Teaching Turkish to Foreigners Set and Yedi Iklim Set by Yunus Emre Institute Prepared for A2 Level in terms of Cultural Transfer'. *Turkish Studies, vol. 13*, no. 4, 2018, pp. 321-344.
- **A32**. Nahide, Aslan, and Mustafa Mavasoglu. 'A Comparative Study of Formulaic Expressions in Textbooks of Turkish as a Foreign Language'. *International Journal of Curriculum and Instructional Studies, vol. 8*, no. 2, 2018, pp. 159-180.
- **A33**. Yayli, Demet, and Derya Yayli. 'An Analysis of Writing Activities in Teaching Turkish as a Foreign Language Textbooks (Yedi İklim Türkçe Sample)'. *PAU Journal of Education*, no. 44, 2018, pp. 132-145.
- **A34**. Sallabas, M. Eyup, and Talha Goktenturk. 'The Value of Nasreddin Hodja Fikras in Terms of Turkish Teaching to Foreigners'. *Bartın University Journal of Faculty of Education*, vol. 7, no. 1, 2018, pp. 206-275.
- **A35**. Cekici, Y. Emre. 'Intertextual Progressivity of Photos in Yedi İklim Türkçe Textbooks at Level B1'. *Journal of Uludağ University Education Faculty, vol. 31*, no. Special Issue, 2018, pp. 205-220.
- **A36**. Iscan, Adem, and Tufan Yassitas. 'Transmission of Culture in Teaching Turkish as a Foreign Language Textbooks: A Sample of Turkish Teaching Set from Yedi İklim (Level B1-B2)'. *Aydın Tömer Dil Dergisi, vol. 3*, no. 1, 2018, pp. 47-66.
- **A37**. Cekici, Y. Emre. 'Writing Tasks in Yedi İklim and İstanbul Textbooks Used in Teaching
- Turkish as a Foreign Language'. *Gaziantep University Journal of Education*, vol. 2, no. 1, 2018, pp. 1-10.
- **A38**. Guven, A. Zeki. 'The Place and Usage of Non-Concrete Cultural Heritage Elements in Turkish Teaching Books for Foreigners'. *International Journal of Language Academy, vol. 6*, no. 1, 2018, pp. 369-378.
- **A39**. Parlak, Hatice. 'An Evaluation on the Features of Usage of the Functional Phonology in Turkish Textbooks for Foreigners'. *International Journal of Languages' Education and Teaching, vol. 6*, no. 4, 2018, pp. 230-243.
- **A40**. Doyumgac, Ibrahim, and Ahat Tezcan. 'Transformational Generative Grammar in Teaching Turkish as a Foreign Language'. *International Journal of Languages' Education and Teaching, vol. 6*, no. 4, 2018, pp. 244-265.
- **A41**. Yilmaz, Fatih and Esma Cetinkaya. 'Cultural Elements in Teaching Turkish to Foreigners Course Books: A Sample of Yedi İklim'. *International Journal of Languages' Education and Teaching, vol. 6*, no. 2, 2018, pp. 121-137.
- **A42**. Basutku, Serdar, and Ersin Durmus. 'Evaluation of B1-Level Vocabulary Teaching Techniques in Teaching Turkish as a Foreign Language'. International Journal of Teaching Turkish as a Foreign Language, vol. 1, no. 2, 2018, pp. 139-162.
- **A43**. Sis, Nesrin, and Ayse Ates. (2018). 'Emphasis on Teaching Turkish as a Foreign Language'. The Journal of Academic Social Science Studies, vol. 68, no. Summer I, 2018, pp. 135-146.
- **A44**. Basar, Sema. 'Determination and Evaluation of the Use Levels of the Works in Turkish Teaching Lectures for Foreigners'. Turkophone, vol. 5, no. 3, 2018, pp. 56-72.
- **A45**. Baskin, Sami. 'Which Cultural Aspects do The Textbooks of Teaching Turkish to Foreigners Transfer?'. *Advances in Language and Literary*

Studies, vol. 9, no. 2, 2018, pp. 131-137.

- **A46**. Kaya, B. Fatma, and Mehmet Y. Yalcin. 'The frequency of using idioms in writing for the
- students learning Turkish as a foreign language'. *Educational Research and Reviews, vol. 13*, no. 16, 2018, pp. 602-608.
- **A47**. Iltar, Latif, and Semih A. Dundar. 'A Comparative Evaluation Study on Teaching Sets Used in Teaching Turkish as a Foreign Language to Syrian Students'. *Education and Society in the 21th Century, vol. 7*, no. 20, 2018, pp. 523-539.
- **A48**. Morali, Gurkan, and Galip Oner. 'Investigation of Intangible Cultural Heritage Elements in Turkish Coursebooks as a Foreign Language'. *Turkish Studies - Language and Literature, vol. 19*, no. 3, 2019, pp. 1343-1357.
- **A49**. Ulutas, Mustafa, and Mehmet Kara. 'Investigation of Text Comprehension Questions in Teaching Turkish as a Foreign Language Textbooks According to Revised Bloom Taxonomy'. *International Journal of Turkish Literature Culture Education, vol. 8*, no. 4, 2019, pp. 2198-2221.
- **A50**. Ozbal, Bayram, and Ayten Genc. 'Evaluation of Exercises Used in Listening Skill Area in Teaching Turkish as a Foreign Language Textbooks'. *SEFAD, no. 42*, 2019, pp. 197-212.
- **A51**. Hasirci, Sevil. 'An Investigation of Speaking Activities in Textbooks for Turkish Teaching as a Foreign Language in terms of the Language Learning Strategies'. *Journal of Language Education and Research, vol. 5*, no. 2, 2019, pp. 314-333.
- A52. Tekin, Eda, and Bayram Bas. 'Teaching Strategies of the Proverbs and Idioms in Turkish Teaching Books as a Foreign Language'. *Journal of Language Education and Research, vol. 5*, no. 2, 2019, pp. 157-171.
- **A53**. Iltar, Latif, and Fatma Acik. 'The Classification of Text Types and The Evaluation of Reading Passages Available in Course Books in Teaching Turkish as A Foreign Language'. *Journal of Turkology, vol. 29*, no. 2, 2019, pp. 311-346.
- **A54**. Gun, Mesut, and Gizem Alptekin. 'Evaluation of Listening Activities of Yedi Iklim Turkish Set of Yunus Emre Institute (Basic Level: A1) on the Framework Program Schedule'. *Journal of History School, no. 43*, 2019, pp. 1836-1851.
- **A55**. Unveren, Dilek. 'Onomatopathy in Teaching Turkish as a Foreign Language'. *EKEV Akademi Dergisi, no. 79*, 2019, pp. 83-99.
- **A56**. Korkmaz, C. Burak. 'Listening Texts Used Teaching Turkish as a Foreign Language Within the Context of Text Classification'. *Journal of Turkology, vol. 29*, no. 1, 2019, pp. 93-126.
- **A57**. Kurudayioglu, Mehmet. 'Examination of Speaking Activities in Turkish as a Foreign Language Coursebooks in Terms of Speech Types'. *Journal of Mother Tongue Education, vol. 7*, no. 3, 2019, pp. 736-750.
- **A58**. Isikoglu, Deniz. 'The Values on the Texts about Target Culture in C1 Course Books of Teaching Turkish as a Foreign Language'. *Journal of Turkish Researches Institute, no. 64*, 2019, pp. 553-562.
- **A59**. Ozcakmak, Huseyin, and Gorkem Y. Tutku. 'Frequency of the Words of Arabic Origin in the Yedi İklim Türkçe Textbook Series'. *Journal of Mother Tongue Education*, vol. 7, no. 4, 2019, pp. 996 - 1009.
- **A60**. Ozbal, Bayram, and Ayten Genc. 'An Evaluation of Exercise Instructions inTurkish as a Foreign Language Textbooks'. *HÜTAD, no. 31*, 2019, pp. 123-146
- **A61**. Meral, M. Hasan. 'The Use of Pronouns in the Coursebooks of Turkish for Foreigners'. *International Journal of Textbooks and Educational Materials*, *vol. 2*, no. 2, 2019, pp. 187-202.
- **A62**. Erdal, Kelime, et al. 'Teaching Turkish as a Foreign Language the Study of A1 and A2
- Level Course Books in Terms of Well-Known People'. *Akademik Bakış Uluslararası Hakemli Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi, no, 72*, 2019, pp. 237-248.
- **A63**. Keskin, Hilal, and Erdogan Yesilyurt. Examination of "Yedi İklim Turkish Teaching Set" Which is Used inTeaching Turkish as a Foreign Language in Terms of Multiple Intelligence Theory'. *Karaelmas Journal of Educational Sciences, vol. 7*, no. 1, 2019, pp. 1-18.

- **A64**. Gulec, Enes. 'Used in Turkish Language Teaching as a Foreign Language Investigation of Reading Texts in Course Books: Gazi TOMER Example. *Bayterek International Journal of Academic Research (BIJAR), vol. 2*, no. 2, 2019, pp. 115-139.
- **A65**. Korkmaz, B. Cihat. 'Numbers of Words of Listening Text Used in Teaching Turkish as a Foreign Language'. *International Journal of Language Academy, vol. 7*, no. 1, 2019, pp. 261-278.
- **A66**. Yilmaz, Fatih, and Esma Cetinkaya. 'Formulaic Expressions on Teaching Turkish as a Foreign Language Coursebooks: A Sample of Yedi İklim'. *International Journal of Language Academy, no. 30*, 2019, pp. 169-185.
- **A67**. Dogan, Nuh. 'The Role and Importance of the Formulaic Language in Turkish Course Books for Foreigners'. *International Journal of Language Academy, no. 30*, 2019, pp. 361-373.
- **A68**. Gun, Mesut, and Burak Ikizcinar. 'The Distribution of Proverbs and Idioms in Reading Text Books Used for Teaching Turkish as a Foreign Language: The Sample of Yedi İklim'. *International Journal of Language Academy, no. 29*, 2019, pp. 214-233.
- **A69**. Karatay, Halit, and Seda Kaya. 'A Framework Program for Conjunctions in Teaching Turkish as a Foreign Language'. *International Journal of Languages' Education and Teaching, vol. 7*, no. 4, 2019, pp. 1-23.
- **A70**. Karatay, Halit, and Seda Kaya. 'A Framework Program for Grammar in Teaching Turkish as a Foreign Language'. *International Journal of Languages' Education and Teaching, vol. 7*, no. 2, 2019, pp. 1-59.
- **A71**. Yildiz, Umit, et al. 'Analysis of Reading Texts in Turkish Course Books for Foreigners in the Context of Text Types, Originality of Texts and Inclusion of Cultural Elements: The Example of Istanbul Course Book Pack for Foreigners'. *International Journal of Languages' Education and Teaching, vol. 7*, no. 2, 2019, pp. 380-401.
- **A72**. Korkmaz, C. Burak. 'Text Teaching Times of Listening Texts Used in Teaching Turkish as a Foreign Language'. *International Journal of Languages' Education and Teaching, vol. 7*, no. 1, 2019, pp. 121-146.
- **A73**. Gun, Mesut, and Pınar Nunukoglu. 'The Evaluation of İzmir Turkish Course Book A1 for Foreigners with Respect to the Principles of Constructivist Approach'. *Researcher, vol. 7*, no. 3, 2019, pp. 88-99.
- **A74**. Yesilyurt, Erdogan. 'Another Dimension of Culture Transfer in Turkish Teaching to Foreigners: Examination of Textbooks in Terms of Gender Preference'. *Zeitschrift für die Welt der Türken, vol. 11*, no. 2, 2019, pp. 213-233.
- **A75**. Bicer, Nursat, and Veli Batdi. 'An Investigation of Textbooks Used to Teach Turkish as a Foreign Language with Rasch Measurement Model and Maxqda'. *Journal of Language and Linguistic Studies, vol. 15*, no. 4, 2019, pp. 1269-1286.
- **A76**. Kardas, Demet. 'Student's Perception of the Effects of the Subjects in Yunus Emre's Yedi Iklim Turkısh B2 and C1 Level Textbooks on the Development of Their Speaking Ability'. *Journal of History School, vol. 12*, no. 38, 2019, pp. 694-716.
- **A77**. Karakoc O. Basak. (2020). 'Transmission of Intangible CulturalHeritage in Turkish Educatıon as a Foreign Language'. *Çukurova Üniversitesi Türkoloji Araştırmaları Dergisi, vol. 5*, no. 2, 2020, pp. 288-312.
- **A78**. Mutlu, H. Huseyin, and Gulsah Set. 'Inspection of Cultural Elements in the C1 Level Books Usedin Teaching Turkish as a Foreign Language (Gazi Turkish for Foreigners - Istanbul Turkish for Foreigners)'. *Language Journal, vol. 1*, no. 171, 2020, pp. 91-108.
- **A79**. Gun, Mesut, and Melike Bakirdogen. 'Examination of Gazi University B1 Level Textbook Listening Department in Teaching Turkish as a Foreign Language'. *Rumeli DE Journal of Language and Literature Studies*, no. Special Issue 7, 2020, pp. 59-79.
- **A80**. Yesilyurt, Seyda. 'Plural Suffix in Teaching Turkish as a Foreign Language'. *Turkish Studies - Education, vol. 15*, no. 3, 2020, pp. 2211-2224.
- **A81**. Yazici, O. Hulya. An Evaluation of the Idioms Used in the Turkish Course Books for Foreigners. *Turkish Journal of Social Research, vol. 24*, no. 2, 2020, pp. 433-449.

- **A82**. Kana, Fatih, and Zeynep E. Guney. 'The analysis According to renewed Bloom Taxonomy of the Questions under the Texts in the Course Books Prepared for Teaching Turkish as a Foreign Language'. *Rumeli DE Journal of Language and Literature Studies*, no. 19, 2020, pp. 141-161.
- **A83**. Hayran, Tugba, and Hulya Yazici. 'An Investigatıon on the Terms Which Take Place in the Course Books Used to Teach Turkish to Foreigners'. *MAKÜ Journal of Faculty of Education*, no. 54, 2020, pp. 336-360.
- **A84**. Bas, Bayram, and Eda Tekin. 'The Importance of Chronological Order in Listening Activities Used in Teaching Turkish as a Foreign Language'. *International Journal of Language, Literature and Culture Researches, vol. 3*, no. 1, 2020, pp. 63-73.
- **A85**. Mutlu, H. Huseyin. Analysis of Readability Levels of Texts in the Course Books Used in Turkish Teaching for Foreigners'. *International Journal of Eurasian Research, vol. 8*, no. 22, 2020, pp. 371-386.
- **A86**. Bayraktar, Semra. 'Formulaic Expressions in Foreign Language Teaching and its Representation in Turkish Teaching Sets for Foreigners'. *Dil Araştırmaları, vol. 14*, no. 27, 2020, pp. 171-197.
- **A87**. Simsek, Ramazan, and Tahsin Aktas. 'Analysis of Course Books Used in Teaching Turkish as A Foreign Language in the Context of Unit Assessment Criteria'. *Cumhuriyet International Journal of Education, vol. 9*, no. 3, 2020, pp. 708-728.
- **A88.** Ozcan, Emrah, and Ozlem T. Dag. 'Frequency Patterns of Words in the Reading Texts in the Course Books of Turkish as a Foreign Language'. *Ankara University Journal of Social Sciences, vol. 11*, no. 2, 2020, pp. 72-80
- **A89**. Gunduz, Fikriye. 'Aspect Category at C1 Level in the Yeni Hitit Turkish for Foreigners Coursebook'. *Ankara University Journal of Social Sciences, vol. 11*, no. 1, 2020, pp. 49-55.
- **A90**. Ayar, Ceylan, and Berk Kurt. 'Adaptation of Adapted Texts in Textbooks Used in Teaching Turkish as a Foreign Language: New Hitit Example'. *Turkish Studies -Education, vol. 15*, no. 3, 2020, pp. 1521-1536.
- **A91**. Varisoglu, Behice, and Merve Micoogulları. 'The Frequency and Use of Basic, Connotative and Figurative Words in theLevel B1 Reading Texts of the Yedi İklim Turkish Teaching Set'. *Sosyal Bilimler Araştırmaları Dergisi, vol. 15*, no. 2, 2020, pp. 568-575.
- **A92**. Sevindik, Azem. 'Use of Folkloric Factors in Teaching Turkish to Foreigner'. Sosyal Bilimler Araştırmaları Dergisi, no. Special Issue I/I, 2020, pp. 12-21.
- **A93**. Boylu, Emrah, and Kubra Baskaya. 'An Examination on the Personality in The Books Used in Turkish Language Teaching as a Foreign Language'. *Turkish Studies - Education, vol. 15*, no. 3, 2020, pp. 1573-1605.
- **A94**. Hayran, Tugba, and Hulya Yazici. 'An Investigation on the Bilaters in The Course Books Used for TeachingForeigners in Turkish Teaching'. *The Journal of International Turkish Language & Literature Research*, no. 3, 2020, pp. 22-40.
- **A95**. Sallabas, M. Eyup, and Hatice Saglik. 'Language Areas of Use in Speaking Activities in Teaching Turkish as Foreign Language Sets'. *Türkiye Education Journal, vol. 5*, no. 1, 2020, pp. 237-249.
- **A96**. Ekinci, Mithat. 'An Investigation of Writing Activities in Teaching Turkish for Foreign Learners: A Coursebook Analysis'. *International Journal of Language Academy, vol. 8*, no. 5, 2020, pp. 65-75.
- **A97**. Bulbul, Ayten. 'Suggested Activities for Consciousness-Raising on Probability Function of –(Y) Acak and –I/Ar Structures in Teaching Turkish as a Foreign Language'. *Journal of Eurasian Language, Education and Research, vol. 4*, no. 1, 2020, pp. 55-81.
- **A98**. Gursoy, A. Ilke, and Gokce Turken. 'An examination on Turkish Course and Workbooks for Foreigners in the Context of Evidential Category'. *International Journal of Language Academy, vol. 8*, no. 5, 2020, pp. 175-186.
- **A99**. Kum, Zehra, and Aybegum A. Gonul. Placement of Conjunctions as Foreign Language in Turkish Teaching. *International Journal of Language Academy, vol. 8*, no. 5, 2020, pp. 327,

343.

- **A100**. Kaya, Seda, and Salih K. Dolunay. 'Grammar Terms in Teaching Turkish as a Foreign Language Basic Level Textbooks'. *International Journal of Language Academy, vol. 8*, no. 4, 2020, pp. 121-134.
- **A101**. Sengen, Yusra, and Ali F. Arici. 'Research of the Vocabulary Dimensions of Depth and Breadth in Teaching Turkish for Foreign Learners through Levels: Yedi İklim Example'. *International Journal of Language Academy, vol. 8*, no. 3, 2020, pp. 267-284.
- **A102**. Bagci, Hasan. 'Comparison of Readability Levels of Texts in Advanced (C1-C2) Course Books Used in Teaching Turkish to Foreigners'. *International Journal of Languages' Education and Teaching, vol. 8*, no. 4, 2020, pp. 279-295.
- **A103**. Karatay, Halit, and Seda Kaya. 'A Proposal for an Instructional Framework for Teaching Postpositions in Teaching Turkish as a Foreign Language'. *International Journal of Languages' Education and Teaching, vol. 8*, no. 3, 2020, pp. 1-23.
- **A104**. Yildirim, Nursen. 'Proverbs and Sayings in Turkish Language Teaching Books for Foreigners'. *International Journal of Languages' Education and Teaching, vol. 8*, no. 1, 2020, pp. 161-176.
- **A105**. Guven, A. Zeki, and Emrullah Banaz. 'Examination of Teaching Turkish as a Foreign Language Textbooks in Terms of Multiple Intelligence Theory (Example of Istanbul B1-B2 Level Turkish for Foreigners Book Set)'. *International Journal of Languages' Education and Teaching, vol. 8*, no. 2, 2020, pp. 44-52.
- **A106**. Cakir, Ramazan. 'An Examination of Seven Climate Book Sets in the Field of Teaching Turkish as a Foreign Language in Terms of Anonym Turkish Folk Literature Elements'. *International Journal of Teaching Turkish as a Foreign Language, vol. 3*, no. 2, 2020, pp. 206-230.
- **A107**. Akgun, Ebru. 'İstanbul Turkish Course and Study Guide for Foreigners in (B1)Assets of Idioms and Proverbs'. *International Journal of Teaching Turkish as a Foreign Language, vol. 3*, no. 2, 2020, pp. 111-146.
- **A108**. Altinok, Koray. 'Gazi Tömer Turkish Instruction Set for Foreigners in the Context of Cultural Heritage and Language Teaching'. *Uluslararası Halkbilimi Araştırmaları Dergisi, vol. 3*, no. 5, 2020, pp. 223-246.
- **A109.** Ugur, Abdullah, and Mesut Gun. 'Assessment of the Activities in the Yedi İklim Turkish Teaching Set Textbooks in Terms of Vocabulary Teaching'. *Researcher, vol. 8*, no. 1, 2020, pp. 220-241.
- **A110**. Celik, Halit. 'Instructor-oriented cultural course materials in teaching Turkish as a foreign language'. *African Educational Research Journal, vol. 8*, no. 2, 2020, pp. 29-42.
- **A111**. Koparan, Betul, and Mehmet Canbulat. 'Examination of a Case Study for the Transference of Turkish Cultural Elements in Turkish Language Teaching'. *Research and Experience Journal (REJ), vol. 5*, no. 2, 2020, pp. 40-57.
- **A112**. Yazici, Nermin, and Ibrahim F. Demirel. 'The View of Video Activities in The Teaching Sets of Turkish as a Foreign Language in Terms of Refusal Strategies'. *International Journal of Language Academy,vol. 9*, no. 3, 2020, pp. 150-167
- **A113**. Simsek, Ramazan, Ilhan Erdem. 'Writing Skills and Acquisition Relationship in Teaching Turkish as a Foreign Language'. *Rumeli DE Journal of Language and Literature Studies*, no. 22, 2021, pp. 280-289.
- **A114**. Gun, Mesut, and Hanife Gecim. 'Evaluation of Listening Texts of Gazi University Level B2 Textbooks'. *Kastamonu Education Journal, vol. 29*, no. 2, 2021, pp. 490-513.
- **A115**. Aktas, Elif. 'Elements Related to Turk and Turkey's Image in Turkish as a Foreign Language Textbooks'. *RumeliDE Journal of Language and Literature Studies, no. 22*, 2021, pp. 232-257.
- **A116**. Simsek, Ramazan. (2021). 'Soft Power Indicator: Reading Texts in Teaching Turkish as a Foreign Language'. *Ondokuz Mayis University Journal of Education Faculty*, vol. 40, no. 1, 2021, pp. 403-422.
- **A117**. Sengezer, Muge, and Zeynep Doyuran. 'Interlexical Sense Relations in Teaching Turkish as a Foreign Language: A Case Study on Yeni

Hitit Yabancılar İçin Türkçe'. *Language Journal, vol. 172*, no. 1, 2021, pp. 108-127.

- **A118**. Gonen, K. Sinem, and Vildan Oncul. 'Teaching Turkish to Foreigners Term Confusion in Textbook'. *International Journal of Turkish Literature Culture Education, no. 10*, 2021, pp. 778-790.
- **A119**. Bagcı, Hasan, and Aydın Ozdemir. 'An Examination of Reading Texts in A1 and A2 Level Textbooks in Terms of Vocabulary (Gazi Unıversity Tömer Examp)'. *MAKÜ Journal of Faculty of Education*, no. 60, 2021, pp. 385-407.
- **A120**. Ilgun, Kursad, and Muammer Nurlu. 'Evaluating Speech Activities Used in Teaching Turkish as a Foreign Language Using an Intercultural Communication Approach'. *Journal of Turkology, vol. 31*, no. 1, 2021, pp. 225-257.
- **A121**. Enser, R. Kandemir. 'A Classification Suggestion about Teaching Accusative Case in Teaching Turkish as a Foreign Language'. *International Journal of Teaching Turkish as a Foreign Language, vol. 4*, no. 1, 2021, pp. 127-144.
- **A122**. Asci, Yasemin. 'Investigation of Writing Exercises in Level B2 Turkish Textbooks for Foreigners in Terms of Developing Communicative Competence'. *Çukurova Araştırmaları, vol. 7*, no. 1, 2021, pp. 175-193.
- **A123**. Aydin, Erkan. 'Analysis of the Root Values of the Yedi Iklim Turkish Teaching SetCourse Books'. *Social Sciences: Theory & Practice, vol. 5*, vol. 2, 2021, pp. 185-195.
- **A124**. Kaplan, Kadir. 'The Use of Intermediary Language in Developing Morphological and
- Syntactic in Teaching Turkish as a Foreign/ Second Language'. *International Journal of Teaching Turkish as a Foreign Language, vol. 4*, no. 1, 2021, pp. 78-92.
- **A125**. Calisir Z. Sevgi. 'Evaluation of Word Lists in Istanbul Turkish Teaching Set for Foreigners'. *KMU Journal of Literature Faculty, vol. 4*, no. Special Issue 1, 2021, pp. 1-14.
- **A126**. Bahsi, Niymet, and Nesrin Sis. 'An Analysis on the Use of the Agglutinative Language Structure of Turkish in the Foreign Language Textbooks (Yedi İklim Türkçe Sample)'. *International Journal of Language Academy, vol. 9*, no. 4, 2021, pp. 112-122.
- **A127**. Kacmaz, Ercan and Ibrahim Demirtas. 'The Function of Cultural Transform of the Proverbs and Idioms in the Sets of Teaching Turkish to Foreigners: Yedi İklim Turkish Course Book (C1) Sample'. *International Journal of Languages' Education and Teaching, vol. 9*, no. 2, 2021, pp. 77-100.
- **A128**. Kiray, Gulay. 'Writing Tasks: Purposes and Variety of Genresin Yeni İstanbul Coursebooks'. *International Journal of Languages' Education and Teaching, vol. 9*, no. 2, 2021, 2021, pp. 124-138.
- **A129**. Iscan, Adem, and Edanur Kanca. Visual Text Harmony in Turkish Language Teaching Textbooks. *Turkish Scientific Researches Journal, Türkiye Bilimsel Araştırmalar Dergisi, vol. 6*, no. 1, 2021, pp. 133-160.
- **A130**. Tunagur, Muhammed. 'Examining the Texts and Pictures in the Seven Climate Turkish Teaching Set in Terms of Gender Roles'. *KMU Journal of Literature Faculty, vol. 4*, no. Special Issue 1, 2021, pp. 35-44.
- **A131**. Tepe, Emin, and Gulden Tum. 'The Reflection of Basic Principles in Course Books for Teaching Turkish as a Foreign Language'. *The Journal of Limitless Education and Research, vol. 6*, no. 1, 2021, pp. 152-178.
- **A132**. Kahtali, B. Dogan, and Mehmet Aslan. 'New Istanbul B1 LevelTurkish Course Book for International Students in Terms of Listening Strategies'. *Education Quarterly Reviews, vol. 4*, no. Special Issue 1: Primary and Secondary Education, 2021, pp. 390-403.
- **A133**. Akyuz, Emine. 'Teacher's Opinions on Listening Texts in Teaching Turkish Foreign Textbooks'. *Journal of History School, no.55*, 2021, pp. 4004- 4021.
- **A134**. Guven, A. Zeki, and Ugur Ozbilen. 'Opinions and Suggestions of the Students Learning Turkish as a Foreign Language about the Textbooks (Istanbul Turkish Learning Set)1'. *Rumeli DE Journal of Language and Literature Studies, no. Special Issue 7*, 2020, pp. 80-91.
- **A135**. Ulker, Mehmet. 'Evaluation of A1 Level Turkish Education Videos of Yunus Emre Institute According to the Multi-Media

Principles'. *International Journal of Turkish Literature Culture Education, vol. 10*, no. 1, 2021, pp. 237-254.

- **A136**. Temizyurek, Melike. 'Analysis of Yedi İklim Türkçe Ders Kitabı B2 Level Reading Texts'. *Uluslararası Türkoloji Araştırmaları ve İncelemeleri Dergisi, vol. 6*, no. 2, 2021, pp. 20-42.

Author Details

Bayram Özbal, *Ministry of National Education, Turkey,* ***Email ID****: ozbalbayram@hotmail.com*